Discovery in 2017: Where are we now and where do we want to be?

William H. Mischo
Michael A. Norman
Mary C. Schlembach

University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign Library
Grainger Engineering Library Information Center

CNI Fall 2017 Membership Meeting
December 12, 2017
Library Discovery at a Crossroads

Academic libraries should “step back to reconfirm (or reconsider) their vision for discovery, to ensure that their visions connect with information-seeking practices and preferences, and to determine whether they have a viable strategy in place ... to achieve their vision”

– Roger Schonfeld, Ithaka S+R, 2014
Full Library Discovery

• Coined by Lorcan Dempsey 2013
• Contains features that move beyond the retrieval of collection materials: includes local information services and content
• Includes library websites, local LibGuide information, subject specialist links, and course management system content

• Bundle and interconnect related information services
Evolution of Discovery

Over the last 30 years:

- **Supercatalogs** with A&I services loaded
- **Federated search systems** employing broadcast searching
- **Web-Scale Discovery Systems (WSDS)** with metadata and full-text content aggregated into a single consolidated index
- **Hybrid bento style systems** with information results presented in a zoned screen display with content grouped by type/material
Challenges in Discovery

Questions:
- Should libraries be the starting point for users seeking scholarly content? Do we care about this?
- Have libraries always played a supplementary role in topical search/exploration?
- Should aiding known-item discovery and effective content delivery be our paramount concern?
- How important is the Gateway function?
Web-Scale Discovery Systems

• Bibliography by Francois Renaville (U of Liege)

• WSDS Issues:
  – Confusion with **blended results displays**
  – **relevancy rankings** burying known-items
  – inadequate **access to local library services**
  – Need to better address **known-item searching**
  – Need to expedite access to **full-text**
Bento Advantages

• Partitions results by material type or format
• Addresses WSDS issues: blended results, relevancy ranking problems, known-item access
• Full library discovery features: displaying vendor/WSDS API results and local information services and content
  – Library websites, pathfinder information, local services, subject specialist links, CMS content
• One click links to full-text or to publisher presentation pages (bypass link resolver)
Illinois Transaction Log Analysis

- July 2016 – June 2017 (latest)
  - 1.49 million searches, 1.15 million clickthroughs
  - Words per query – 5.11 (up from 3.76 & 4.11)
  - 10% are one word, 24.7% > 7 words, 49.2% were <= 3 words
  - Many copy-and-paste of title, author/title, full citations
  - DOI searches (73 searches per day)
  - Sample of 4100 searches, **Known-item searching = 56%**
  - Users often have a material type in mind when they search
  - Use of search assistance high
  - Limit operations using Gateway tabs to material types
User Preferences

• Users still want access to specialized disciplinary databases (Gardner & Inger, Lundrigan et al)

• Many users come in with a clear idea of what they want: a known-item book, journal article, journal title, web site, etc.

• Delivery of full-text is paramount
Delivery is Discovery

- Seeing transition from ‘finding’ to ‘getting’: “discovery was ... incomplete unless accompanied by new methods that ensured the desired item could in turn be easily found and physically accessed by clients” (Denholm at al).

- Hanrath and Kottman study emphasized the “difficulty of separating issues of delivery from issues of discovery.”

- Frustration with link resolver menus (Ellero)
Illinois Bento features

- Employs context-specific and adaptive search assistance
  - Spelling suggestion links, Libguide links, direct links for frequent searches, limit suggestions, DOI identification, online chat link, journal title links
- Direct link to PDF when available
- DOI, publisher, SFX links for articles, e-book links from catalog
- Altmetric badges
- Writes out custom transaction logs
# Bento Clickthroughs by Category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>User Clickthroughs by Category</th>
<th>Percentages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Article links</td>
<td>56.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPACs and Books</td>
<td>33.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-text clicks</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggestions</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal Title links</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library links or contacts</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bento Feature Sets

• 38 academic libraries with bento instances
  – All have Books and Articles areas
  – WSDS for articles: 15 Summon, 4 Primo, 10 EDS
  – Other resources:
    • Website search = 17
    • Library/research guides = 12
    • Journal titles = 12
    • Databases = 14
    • Digital collections = 11
    • Subject Top Picks = 10
    • Contacts = 10
  – OPAC often separate application: VuFind, Blacklight
Bento Libraries

Bento Observations

• Feature sets vary; many bento versions do not do spell checking and do not provide direct links to full-text
• Only three employ the one-click to full-text w/p going through local link resolver
• Have local control and customization
• But, requires programming/server staff and maintenance ... API processing
• Need for catalog item availability and direct links to ebooks
Next Steps

• Augment displayed records (asynchronously):
  – Supporting article datasets from Scholix or CrossRef Data Events records
  – Open Access records from oadoi, GS, or other source
  – Add Impact Factor, SNIP, Eigenvalue, CiteScore or other journal title evaluative information

• Integration of complementary digital services
  – Data management services
  – High-definition visualization & analytics
  – Publication metrics
  – Course management content
  – Faculty profile systems