Assessing for Digital Library Reuse
Initial Findings from The Measuring Reuse Project

Genya O’Gara
Caroline Muglia
Santi Thompson
Elizabeth Joan Kelly
Ayla Stein Kenfield
Liz Woolcott
Presentation Outline

I. Project Background
II. Initial Survey
III. Focus Group Sessions
IV. Use Cases
V. Follow Up Survey
VI. Next Steps
Project Background

Santi Thompson
Santi Thompson
University of Houston
sathomp3@central.uh.edu  | @SantiThompson

Elizabeth Joan Kelly
Loyola University, New Orleans
ejkelly@loyno.edu  | @ElizabethJelly

Caroline Muglia
University of Southern California
muglia@usc.edu

Genya O’Gara
Virtual Library of Virginia, George Mason University
gogara@gmu.edu  | @genyao

Ayla Stein Kenfield
University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign
astein@illinois.edu  | @TheStacksCat

Liz Woolcott
Utah State University
liz.woolcott@usu.edu  | @lizwoolcott

#digreuse
Project Team
reuse.diglib.org
Assessment Interest Group (AIG)


INSTITUTE of Museum and Library SERVICES

2017 National Leadership Grant (LG-73-17-0002-17)

July 01, 2017 – June 30, 2018
Project Deliverables

Functional requirements and use cases for a reuse assessment toolkit

▸ Sustainable and vetted assessment techniques
▸ Methods to deepen understanding of users
▸ Developing approaches and best practices to communicate impact

Final Products

▸ White paper
▸ Grant Report
▸ Project Data

Where to find deliverables

▸ Website: https://reuse.diglib.org
▸ OSF Repository: https://osf.io/y5tjh
Advisory Board

Hannah Frost
Emily Gore
Krystyna K. Matusiak
Sandra Phoenix
Dorothea Salo
Ali Shiri
Assessing Use vs. Reuse

**Use**
Discovering and browsing objects in a digital repository, often described as “downloads” or “clicks,” without knowing the specific context for the use.

*Ex. Web analytics; CMS supplied analytics*

**Reuse**
How often and in what ways digital repository materials are utilized and/or repurposed, knowing the context of the use.

*Ex. Social media use; reverse image lookup*
Our Process

Data Collection And Analysis

Initial Survey Results

Focus Group Coded Data

Prioritized Reuse Assessment Use Cases

UC

S

FG
Initial Survey
Initial Survey Details

**Open:**
September-October

**Software:**
Qualtrics

**Questions:**
- 19 total
- 10 “core”

**Responses:**
- 409 total
- 302 usable
- 130 answered all core questions

**Respondents:**
- 56% academic libraries
- 10% public libraries
- 8% museums
  (Remaining: archives; government libraries; historical societies; consortium; other)
- 30% primarily serve under-represented groups
Initial findings

Do you collect use statistics?

- Don't Collect: 20.0%
- Collect: 80.0%
Initial findings

Do you collect reuse statistics?

- Collect: 40.0%
- Don't Collect: 60.0%
Because...

- **Improve** digital collections **services**
- **Demonstrate the impact** of collections on scholarship and research
- **Prove the return on investment**
- **Improve** collection **selection** decisions
Platforms and Methods

Use:
Most common platforms:
- Google Analytics
- CMS Platform Stats

Most common data collected:
- Number of visitors
- Number of downloads
- Number of clicks

Reuse:
Most common methods:
- Social media metrics
- Alert services
- Reverse Image lookup

Most common data collected:
- Citations in scholarship
- Published or replicated in physical media
Barriers

Use:

- No or new digital collections
- Lack of staff
- Different department’s purview
- Not a priority

Reuse:

- Lack of methodology/system
- Lack of staff/time
- Not an institutional focus
- Lack of training/resources
Obstacles to Assessment
Most of our understanding of reuse comes anecdotally. We haven't figured out a good quantitative way to measure reuse that isn't too labor intensive for us. This is a pain point, since reuse is highly valued by stakeholders!
Focus Group Sessions

Genya O’Gara
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus Group</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Sessions</th>
<th>When</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Topic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group 1</td>
<td>In person</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>October 2017</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Information Gathering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 1</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>December 2017</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Information Gathering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 2</td>
<td>In person</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>February 2018</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Technology &amp; Standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 2</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>March 2018</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Technology &amp; Standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 3</td>
<td>In person</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>April 2018</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Cultural &amp; Privacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 3</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>June 2018</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Cultural &amp; Privacy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Focus Group Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution Type</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic Library</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Library</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museum</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consortium</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic Archive</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Focus Library</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (Corporate Library, Library Association, State Archives)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Focus Group Analysis

Document → Code → Generate Use Cases
Examples of Reuse

- metadata aggregators
- digital exhibits
- archiving websites
- social media
- commercializing content
- blogs/other online publishing
- scholarly citations
- support cultural or political statements
- games
- commentary/annotation
- remixes
- presentations

- digital humanities project/research
- virtual reality environment
- genealogical research
- institutional history
- educational lesson plans/instruction
- research for historic preservation
- Wikipedia citations
- documentary footage and/or research
- workshop and training sessions
- marketing materials
Technology
“Sticky” metadata, Data dashboards, Unique identifiers for all digital objects

Standards & Training
...for gathering data, turning data into impact statements and stories, in using data to make decisions, in weighing the importance of data, in respecting user privacy

Sharing
Collections data, success and failures, usage/reusage data repositories
Reuse Assessment
Use Cases
Use Cases

Data Collection, Analysis, and Reporting
Use cases that address how reuse data is being assembled, interpreted, and communicated to various audiences and stakeholders.

Privacy, Rights Management, and Ethics
Use cases that address the assessment of reuse through legal, ethical, and culturally-aware perspectives.

Collection Development
Use cases that address how to assess aspects of a digital collection based on reuse data.
Data Collection, Analysis, and Reporting (1 of 2)

The practitioner:
- assesses quality and quantity of items reused from peer institutions for benchmarking
- wants to tell stories of impact with the reuse data they’ve captured and tailor them to various audiences/stakeholders
- generates reports of collection item reuse for analysis
Data Collection, Analysis, and Reporting (2 of 2)

The practitioner:

▸ employs qualitative and quantitative methods to collect reuse data
▸ understands how content is being reused in a variety of contexts by various audiences.
▸ can find best practice documentation for collecting, analyzing, and reporting re-use data
▸ is able to articulate the similarities and differences between use and reuse
Privacy, Rights Management, and Ethics (1 of 2)

The practitioner:

- wants to know who their users are without violating user privacy
- can identify appropriative reuses of materials from marginalized communities
- can identify platforms/venues where reuse content is occurring for commercial or marketing gain
Privacy, Rights Management, and Ethics (2 of 2)

The practitioner:

- wants to enable/encourage attribution of materials from their collection in various reuse contexts
- provides ability for marginalized communities to report incidents of reuse that the community perceives as culturally exploitive
- uses a code of ethics/conduct for assessing the reuse of content from diverse communities
Collection Development

The practitioner:

- assesses quality and quantity of items reused to identify strengths and gaps in digital collections
- assesses quality and quantity of items reused to inform digitization projects and priorities
- update existing access records with value-added content made by re-users
- develop outreach services based on reuse data
- implement DAMS/DLS with specific functionality for enabling reuse
Follow Up Survey

Caroline Muglia
14 questions
7 demographic, 7 topical questions

80% completion
232 completed responses, 289 total

54% Academic
Largest response group
Next largest: 18% public libraries
## Comparison to Initial Survey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total Questions</th>
<th>Usable Responses</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Under-served populations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Academic</td>
<td>Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>302</td>
<td>56.3%</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow-Up</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Barriers to Digital Collection Assessment

- **Lack of time**: 7.03
- **Lack of established standards and best practices**: 6.85
- **Lack of tools to collect/analyze assessment metrics**: 6.69
- **Software/system silos and restraints**: 6.59
- **Lack of expertise for interpreting assessment metrics**: 6.19
- **Lack of training**: 6.19
- **Tools for metric collection and analysis are too complex**: 5.71
- **Not a priority of my institution**: 5.37
- **Concern about user privacy**: 5.24
- **Assessment data is unreliable**: 5.12
- **Not sure what to do with assessment data**: 5.01

 weighted and averaged (n=226, range 5.01-7.03)
Use Cases

- Data Collection, Analysis, and Reporting
- Collection Development
- Privacy, Rights Management, & Ethics
Use Cases: Data Collection, Analysis, Responsibility

- Understands how content is being reused in a variety of contexts by various audiences
- Wants to tell stories of impact with the reuse data they've captured and tailor them to various audiences/stakeholders
- Generates reports of collection item reuse for analysis
- Employs qualitative and quantitative methods to collect reuse data
- Can find best practice documentation for collecting, analyzing, and reporting re-use data
- Assesses quality and quantity of items reused from peer institutions for benchmarking

*weighted and averaged (n=218, range 3.01-4.37)*
Use Cases: Collection Development

Assesses quality and quantity of items reused to inform digitization projects and priorities

Assesses quality and quantity of items reused to identify strengths and gaps in digital collections

weighted and averaged (n=184, range 1.45-1.55)
Use Cases:
Privacy,
Rights management,
Ethics

weighted and averaged
(n=220, range 2.65-3.66)
Functionalities for a Reuse Assessment Toolkit

- Best Practices: 13.09
- Quick start guides/tutorials: 13.04
- Samples or templates (reports, marketing, etc.): 12.48
- Examples of places or institutions implementing specific practices: 11.78
- Text-based guides/tutorials: 11.67
- List/Links to tools/technologies: 11.41
- Video guides/tutorials: 11.35
- FAQs: 11.27
- Webinars: 11.26
- In-person trainings: 10.89
- Asynchronous training modules: 10.59
- Resource Library/List of readings: 9.95
- Glossary of terminology: 9.85
- Expertise/Contact List: 9.51
- Links to outside resources: 9.46
- List/calendar of training opportunities: 9.41
- Forums: 8.87
- Listservs: 8.58
- Blog: 8.09
- Slack channel integration: 7.45

(weighted and averaged (n=223, range 7.45-13.09))
Spread the word


- Performance Measurements & Metrics, “Barriers and Solutions to Assessing Digital Library Reuse: Preliminary Findings”
Continuing to explore

- Recontextualization & controversial contexts of reused digital assets
- Platforms must keep up with practitioners
- Demonstrate value and impact
- Privacy and reuse
Applied for another grant

- Focus on **building** toolkit based on use cases and functional requirements
THANKS!

What are your questions?

reuse.diglib.org
CREDITS

Special thanks to all the people who made and released these awesome resources for free:

▸ Presentation template by SlidesCarnival
▸ Photographs by Unsplash